

John J. Duffy (SB No. 6224834)
Kevin M. Ringel (SB No. 6308106)
Margaret C. Redshaw (SB No. 6327480)
SWANSON, MARTIN & BELL, LLP
330 N Wabash, Suite 3300
Chicago, Illinois 60611
Tel: (312) 321-9100; Fax: (312) 321-0990
jduffy@smbtrials.com
kringel@smbtrials.com
mredshaw@smbtrials.com

Marc G. Cowden (SB No. 169391)
Adam Stoddard (SB No. 272691)
**SHEUERMAN, MARTINI, TABARI,
ZENERE & GARVIN**
1033 Willow Street
San Jose, California 95125
Tel: (408) 288-9700; Fax: (408) 295-9900
mcowden@smtlaw.com
astoddard@smtlaw.com

Counsel for Defendant Chart Inc.

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION**

IN RE PACIFIC FERTILITY CENTER
LITIGATION

Case No. 3:18-cv-01586-JSC

**DECLARATION KEVIN RINGEL IN
SUPPORT OF DEFENDANT CHART
INC.'S MOTION TO EXCLUDE
ANAND KASBEKAR AND DAVID
WININGER**

Date: March 4, 2021
Time: 9:00 a.m.
Judge: Hon. Jacqueline Scott Corley
Place: Zoom

1 I, Kevin Ringel, declare as follows:

2 1. I am a partner at the law firm of Swanson, Martin & Bell, LLP, which is counsel
3 of record for Defendant Chart Inc. I am an attorney admitted to practice in the State of Illinois
4 and am admitted *pro hac vice* before this Court. I submit this declaration in support of Chart's
5 Motion to Exclude Plaintiffs' Experts Anand Kasbekar and David Wininger (Motion). I have
6 personal knowledge of the matters stated herein.

7 2. Attached hereto as **Exhibit A** is a true and correct copy of Anand Kasbekar's
8 Expert Report dated November 6, 2020.

9 3. Attached hereto as **Exhibit B** is a true and correct copy of Anand Kasbekar's
10 Rebuttal Report dated December 4, 2020.

11 4. Attached hereto as **Exhibit C** is a true and correct copy of the transcript of the
12 December 13, 2019 deposition of Anand Kasbekar, taken in this action with the court reporter's
13 signed certification.

14 5. Attached hereto as **Exhibit D** is a true and correct copy of the transcript of the
15 November 25, 2020 deposition of Anand Kasbekar, taken in this action with the court reporter's
16 signed certification.

17 6. Attached hereto as **Exhibit E** is a true and correct copy of the transcript of the
18 December 15, 2020 deposition of Anand Kasbekar, taken in this action with the court reporter's
19 signed certification.

20 7. Attached hereto as **Exhibit F** is a true and correct copy of David Wininger's
21 Expert Report dated November 6, 2020.

22 8. Attached hereto as **Exhibit G** is a true and correct copy of the transcript of the
23 November 30, 2020 deposition of David Wininger, taken in this action with the court reporter's
24 signed certification.

25 9. Attached hereto as **Exhibit H** is a true and correct copy of Franklin Miller's
26 Expert Report dated November 20, 2020.

27 10. Attached hereto as **Exhibit I** is a true and correct copy of Franklin Miller's
28 Rebuttal Report dated December 11, 2020.

